COMPARATIVE LITERATURE BETWEEN FAIRY TALES *ASHPUTTEL* BY GRIMM'S INTO *CINDERELLA* BY DISNEY'S (INTRINSIC ELEMENTS TRANSFORMATION)

SASTRA BANDINGAN ANTARA DONGENG *ASHPUTTEL* KARYA GRIMM MENJADI *CINDERELLA* KARYA DISNEY (TRANSFORMASI UNSUR INTRINSIK)

Kartika Bhakti Pratiwi
STKIP PGRI Jombang
kartika11pratiwi@gmail.com

URL: DOI:

Abstract

The researcher intends to present a comparison and would like to explore the transformation of fairy tales. To know the differences, the researcher is interested in finding intrinsic elements. Also, to reveal the transformation in intrinsic elements, the researcher was interested in finding the comparison using comparative literature between fairy tales Ashputtel and Cinderella. The researcher categorized the research as library research since the researcher did not take experimental research. The researcher discovers evidence in the data and gives explanations based on the theory that was taken in the book. The researcher uses a comparative literature approach to find similarities and dissimilarities in the two fairy tales. From the data analysis result, five intrinsic elements have been found. Namely, themes, plot, character and characterization, setting, and point of view. From the intrinsic elements that have been compared, four transformation occurred. Namely, theme, plot, characters, and characterization, also setting. In conclusion, the reason why intrinsic elements transformation happens is caused by the goals of each author. In Ashputtel, Grimms would like to preserve German folk tales as their cultural identity. In contrast, Disney would like to present cinematic production to entertain American audiences, both children and adults.

Keywords: Comparative Literature, Intrinsic Elements, Ashputtel, Cinderella.

Abstrak

Peneliti bermaksud untuk menyajikan perbandingan antara dua dongeng dan ingin mengeksplorasi transformasi dongeng. Untuk mengetahui perbedaan tersebut, peneliti tertarik untuk menemukan unsur intrinsiknya. Selain itu, untuk mengungkap transformasi dua dongeng dalam unsur intrinsik, peneliti tertarik untuk mencari perbandingannya dengan menggunakan sastra bandingan. Peneliti fokus menganalisis tema, plot, karakter dan penokohan, setting, dan sudut pandang yang terdapat dalam dua dongeng, yaitu Ashputtel (1812) karya Grimms dan Cinderella (1950) karya Disney.

Untuk mencapai masalah dan tujuan penelitian, peneliti mengkategorikan penelitian ini sebagai penelitian kepustakaan karena peneliti tidak mengambil penelitian eksperimental. Peneliti menemukan bukti dalam data dan memberikan penjelasan berdasarkan teori yang diambil dalam buku. Peneliti menggunakan pendekatan sastra bandingan dalam analisis ini untuk menemukan persamaan dan perbedaan dalam kedua dongeng tersebut.

Dari hasil analisis data, ditemukan lima unsur intrinsik pada Ashputtel dan Cinderella. Yakni, tema, plot, penokohan dan penokohan, setting, dan sudut pandang. Dari unsur intrinsik yang telah dibandingkan, terjadi empat transformasi unsur intrinsik. Yakni, tema, plot, karakter, dan penokohan, serta setting. Kesimpulannya, alasan terjadinya transformasi unsur intrinsik disebabkan oleh tujuan masing-masing pengarang. Di Ashputtel, Grimms ingin melestarikan cerita rakyat Jerman sebagai identitas budaya mereka. Sebaliknya, Disney ingin menghadirkan produksi sinematik untuk menghibur penonton Amerika, baik anak-anak maupun orang dewasa.

Kata kunci: Sastra Perbandingan, Unsur Intrinsik, Ashputtel, Cinderella.

Introduction

Literature is an expression of words as the medium whether those words are recorded or written (Taylor, 1981:8). Literature is an expression of humans in form of written or spoken based on thoughts, opinions, and feelings through language. However, literature is usually associated with the pleasures of reading but it has been an object for scholarly inquiry (Wurth and Rigney, 2006:19). The existence of literature itself could not be separated from human life. Through literature, humans can document the events, and present imaginative work also historic narratives.

The nature of literature holds both spoken and written (Taylor, 1981:8). Literature is not only limited write on paper. The literary creation can come from oral literature that is widely spread in the community. Oral or spoken literature

refers to any form of verbal literature which is transmitted orally or delivered by word of mouth. Oral literature is also referred to as folk literature. As stated by Wellek and Warren (1977), "Written literature derives from folk literature." Folktale is present from generation to generation through spoken narrative, then it develops and spreads in the community. In the present day, folktales are developed into other parts. Such as fables, myths, legends, epics, fairy tales, etc.

A fairy tale is a part of the folktale that relies on bad and good characters that are easily recognized (Lukens, 2007:24). Fairy tales are identical to tales of magic, fairy, and beast. Fairy tales are preserved as a bedtime stories for children. Not having to read alone, parents can recount fairy tales before their children go to sleep. Fairy tales have acceptable because instruct children through explicit warnings and lessons (Zipes, 2002). Sometimes the author presents messages or values in their tales.

Same as other literature, fairy tales contain literary elements which are constructed in the story. Fairy tales are composed of some literary elements. Themes, plot, characters, setting, and point of view consist of intrinsic elements (Lukens, 2007). An intrinsic element is an element that composes a story which structured inside the story. Without those elements, the author difficult to create and build the story. That is the reason why each story always has intrinsic elements, including fairy tales.

Brothers Grimm is one of the famous authors of fairy tales. Brothers Grimm are a brotherhood who was born and raised in Hanau, Germany. Grimms decided to start their journey by collecting several stories from farmers and villagers in Germany. Each story they wrote were included in a book entitled *Kinder-und Hausmärchen* or *Grimm's Fairy Tales* published on 1812. Brothers Grimm became famous because of their contribution to folktales, sociohistorical, and ideological perspectives (Zipes, 2002:76). In *Grimm's Fairy Tales*, most of the stories are taken from German in oral sources, although Grimms changed it into print. However, they do not change the folkloric character. The reason why Grimms write down the story was that they wanted to preserve it before the tales were lost forever.

The other popular fairy tale maker is Walt Disney from America. Walt Disney is an American entertainment industry that was founded in 1923. Walt Disney produced child cartoons, live actions, and fairy tales. Such as *Snow White*, *Rapunzel*, *The Sleeping Beauty*, and other stories. The most familiar tale from Disney is *Cinderella*. There have been countless movies, and stage productions as interpretations and retellings of Cinderella's character throughout the world (Calero, 2015). There are many *Cinderella* versions, such as *Cinderella* live-action

which was released on 2015, and the latest version of *Cinderella* by Fulwell73 Productions that released on 2021.

As periods and times go by, the field of literature will also expand. For example *Cinderella* stories. The story of *Cinderella* continues to evolve and appear from one version to another. Moreover, to look at the development of literature through different periods, it would be meaningful to use literary comparison. Comparative literature involves the study of texts across cultures, that is connect literature across both time and space (Bassnett, 1993:1). Comparative literature exists because it is affected by the motifs of each creator. In comparative literature, there will always be a term called a hypogram. Hypogram is the main principle in the literature that will give birth to the next works (Riffaterre, 1978). So, the hypogram is a literary work that becomes the background for the next literary work creation. While the next work or the new one is called as transformation work.

The researcher wanted to find and analyze about how the hypogram and transformation in fairy tales. The researcher chose two fairy tales entitled *Ashputtel* (1812) by Brothers Grimm and *Cinderella* (1950) by Walt Disney. Because both the fairy tales have a time relationship. In this research, the researcher selects *Ashputtel* (1812) as the hyprogram while *Cinderella* (1950) by Disney as the transformation. The researcher presented the intrinsic elements contained in Ashputtel and Cinderella. Also, the researcher provided which are in intrinsic elements between two fairy tales which has transformed. To sharpen the analysis, the researcher also presents the reason why the transformation of the intrinsic elements can happen. This research can be reflected in education as media of learning. In learning literature, students not only gain insight through reading but also are able to know the relevance of literature from one period to another period. This research is also expected to be a model for English Department students in studying literature in terms of literary comparison.

Research Methods

Research design is a plan and the procedure for research to detailed methods of data collection and analysis (Cresswell, 2009). This research used library research as a research design. the researcher used a comparative literature approach as the guide to examine the similarities and dissimilarities between two fairy tales in intrinsic elements. In addition, the researcher used literary comparison as an approach to find which are in intrinsic elements between *Ashputtel* and *Cinderella* that has been transformed.

Results and Discussion

1. **Intrinsic Elements in Ashputtel and Cinderella**
    a. **Theme**

    Theme is the main idea of the story. The author built the story by present the theme and then gather all the other elements, such as plot, character and characterization, setting, and point of view. Theme as main idea could be able to find through each paragraph (explicit) and after read the whole story from beginning to the ending (implicit). Ashputtel and Cinderella fairy tales contain explicit and implicit themes. The researcher found the explicit theme from several lines and dialogues inside the narration. Meanwhile, Ashputtel and Cinderella present same implicit theme. The story tells about an orphan girl who has miserable life because of her wicked mother and stepsisters. Despite having a father, mother, and two sisters, Ashputtel's life remains empty. She has to do housework everyday. But everything has changed when she meets the Prince. And finally, the Prince bring Ashputtel with him to the castle.

    b. **Plot**

    In the Ashputtel and Cinderella fairy tales, the author use a chronological plot. Where the sequence of time is sequentially starting from morning to afternoon, afternoon to evening, evening to night, night to midnight. The plot tends to go forward without any flashback. The following plot started from exposition-rising action-climax-resolution. Each story depicts the main character's poor life due to her stepfamily at the beginning of the story. The situation started to rise when Ashputtel and Cinderella lost one of their slippers. That conflict leads to the climax when the slipper can not be fitted in the stepsister's foot. Ultimately, Ashputtel and Cinderella live with the prince at the castle. From the description of each plot, it showed that the sequence of the plot of each story used a simple plot. In addition, the type of conflict is person-against-person. Where the Ashputtel and Cinderella as main character have to faced and experiences miserably life because of her wicked family.

    c. **Character and Characterization**

    According to Lukens (2007), character become main element as a the term to mean a person, also personified between animal or object. Because fairy tales is narrative reading, animal that able to act like human include as character. The researcher found differences in the authors showing the characters in Ashputtel and Cinderella. Some characters are

highlighted with a lot of narration in line, such as Ashputtel or Cinderella as the main character, stepmother or Lady Tremaine, stepsisters or Anastasia and Drizella Tremaine, and the prince. But some characters are less described, such as Ashputtel's mother and grand Duke in Cinderella. The researcher also found the character that indicates a change of action, such as Ashputtel's father, even though the other characters do not indicate any changes from the beginning to the end. Based on research found by the researcher, there are differences in the distribution of characters.

d. Setting

The researcher found Ashputtel and Cinderella explains the setting of the place where they live and setting of time. Both Ashputtel and Cinderella live in a house with an attic. Their house is in the area ruled by a king in the kingdom. For the second, the researcher also found the time setting in each fairy tale. Ashputtel and Cinderella stories concerning of setting of time such as: the morning, evening, night, winter, and spring seasons.

e. Point of View

In both versions, Ashputtel's and Cinderella's author uses a lot of third-person pronouns. Such as "she," "he," "they," "him," and "her." It is clearly stated that Ashputtel and Cinderella fairy tales show the same point of view, which is the third point of view.

2. Intrinsic Elements Transformation Between Ashputtel into Cinderella

a. Theme

From Ashputtel to Cinderella, the researcher found transformations in theme. There is explicit theme that changed from the Ashputtel into Cinderella fairy tales. The significant element transformation stand out from the reason and purpose by each author. Grimms wrote Ashputtel to preserve European folktales as their cultural identity, whereas Disney customizes Cinderella stories due to requirement of cinematic presentation and entertainment needs. Both of the fairy tales have differences in explicit.

In Ashputtel, because she was often treated badly, she always cried and begged to the bird to help her. The bird capable grant everything that Ashputtel's wished for. The Interaction between Ashputtel and the bird is a representation of the relationship between individuals and God. Grimms wants to show the existence of God through natural images. In

accordance with their background who influenced and pursued by Romantic atmosphere. In Grimms version, there is a part when Ashputtel stepmother encourages her older daughter to mutilate her toes and squeezed the younger heel to try to fit into the slipper. The passage written by Grimms reflect their goal to show about their national culture by preserve German folktale. Grimm wrote Ashputtel based on story that developed among the German people. The violence that appears in the story it seems come straight from the folk. Story by Grimms written as it was with the tales told by German people. Historically, before Renaissance, Europe is known as darks ages. At that time, there were many wars, famines, Black Death pandemics, also many executions and violence against children. Violence and conflict in the tales derive from human psychology. Which means the violence part, came from German people psychology who were influenced with social life of Europe dark ages at that time. Like in the Grimms, Disney also showed supernatural figure. Disney animated supernatural as fairy godmother who have magical power. The magic fairy tales were the most popular and acceptable in America during nineteenth century. In addition, Disney careful to delete the mutilation in Ashputtel. The deletion of bloody scene was done as reflection that the scene had to be changed for cinematic presentation. Cinderella story was made softly to entertain the readers, by showing romantics messages in family relationship.

Based on the comparative analysis of Ashputtel and Cinderella, there is a transformation in the theme. In Ashputtel, the researcher found why Grimms showed the bird as a supernatural figure and why Grimms explicitly wrote violence in their story. The reason is that Grimms reflect their goal to show their national culture by preserving German folktale. However, in Cinderella, Disney changes the Grimm's goal to be more neutral. Disney wrote their own Cinderella version to be more entertaining due to the requirement of cinematic presentation and entertainment commodities that both adults and children can enjoy.

b. **Plot**

It is quite clear to spot differences between Ashputtel and Cinderella in plot. From narration perspective, Ashputtel has a slightly longer plot than plot in Cinderella. The tale in Ashputtel also contain the repetition when Ashputtel wants the nice dress to the bird and also when the prince dance together with Ashputtel for three times in the ball. However in Cinderella, there is not repetition plot. Cinderella and the prince only

dance once. The narration reduction in Cinderella is influenced by the film feature length in Disney. Disney is the home production that producing feature-length fairy tale films. A feature length film is a film that has a run time between 80 minutes until 180 minutes. Because it is not possible to tell all the plot in Ashputtel due to the feature length, Disney adjust the plot in Cinderella as suit with the feature length of film duration into 80 minutes including the credits.

Based on the comparative analysis of Ashputtel and Cinderella, a transformation happens in the plot. From a narration perspective, Ashputtel has a slightly longer plot than the plot in Cinderella. The tale in Ashputtel also contains the repetition of when Ashputtel wants the perfect dress for the bird and when the prince dances with Ashputtel three times at the ball. However, in Cinderella, there is no repetition plot. The researcher found that Disney reduces the narration because the film feature length influences it in Disney. Because it is impossible to tell all the plot in Ashputtel due to the feature-length, Disney adjusts the plot in Cinderella to suit the feature-length film duration into 80 minutes, including the credits.

c.   **Character and Characterization**

In general, the characters in the *Ashputtel* and *Cinderella* fairy tales are not much different from each other. Characters such as stepmother, two stepsisters, and prince are introduced in each story. In *Ashputtel* by Grimms, the tale indicate the characters more realistic than magical that contained in *Cinderella* by Disney. The introduction of the bird as supernatural figure and as well as how Ashputtel begged her wish to be granted, represent the relation between individuals and God. Grimms retelling the narratives with spiritual feelings between human and God and giving faith to the readers to avoid pagan religious. Pagan or paganism is commonly used and refers to someone who practices and traditions to beliefs with pagans or statue. However, in Cinderella, Disney added additional character such as Gus and Jaq as cute animals to provide the sideliness of the fairy tale. Which means, Disney has to reshaped the character from Ashputtel that influenced by the Christian charity and capitalism. To satisfy the audience expectations, Disney transformed the character in the tale to be neutral to entertain American audiences both adults and children. Through Disney industry the Grimm's tales have been "Disneyized" as how most Americans receive.

Based on the comparative analysis of *Ashputtel* and *Cinderella*, a transformation happens in the characters. In *Ashputtel* by Grimms, the tale indicates the characters are more realistic than magical than contained in *Cinderella* by Disney. In *Ashputtel* by Grimms, the introduction of the bird as a supernatural figure represent the relation between individuals and God. Grimms retells the narratives with spiritual feelings between humans and God and gives faith to the readers to avoid pagan religion. However, in *Cinderella*, Disney provides the sidelines of the fairy tale by a present cute characters such as Gus and Jaq as cute animals. Disney transformed the character in the tale to be cute and funny to entertain American audiences, both adults and children.

d. Setting

The main setting in *Ashputtel* and *Cinderella* is located in Kingdom area where the land is ruled by a King. In both of the stories, part of the house such as garden and attic are equally mentioned. The setting of time such as morning, evening, and night are also mentioned either. Each morning, Ashputtel and Cinderella have to work. And when it comes evening, they may able to take a rest after work. At night, both of Ashputtel and Cinderella come to the ball invitation and danced with the Prince. Although Ashputtel and Cinderella has the same setting, there is a transformation that occured in it. The setting of time in *Ashputtel* by Grimms shows more detail. Such as, when Ashputtel lost her mother and time when her father's wedding that was hels in the spring. Meanwhile in *Cinderella*, Disney did not write a setting of time when *Cinderella* lost her parents. The transformation occured because Grimms and Disney wanted to maintain their goals. Where Grimms wrote based on a tales that already exist among Germans, while Disney adapted the story for cinematic presentation for film production.

Based on the comparative analysis of *Ashputtel* and *Cinderella*, a transformation happens in the setting. The primary setting in *Ashputtel* and *Cinderella* is the Kingdom area, where a King rules the land. In both stories, parts of the house, such as the garden and attic, are equally mentioned. The setting of time, such as morning, evening, and night are also mentioned. However, *Ashputtel* Grimms shows the setting of time in more detail. Such as when Ashputtel lost her mother and the time when her father's wedding was held in the spring. Meanwhile, in *Cinderella*, Disney did not write a setting of the time when *Cinderella* lost her parents. The transformation occurred because Grimms and Disney

wanted to maintain their goals, whereas Grimms wrote based on tales that already existed among Germans. At the same time, Disney adapted the story for cinematic presentation for film production.

Conclusion

There are five intrinsic elements found in *Ashputtel* and *Cinderella* fairy tales. The elements including themes, plot, character and characterization, setting, and point of view. From the intrinsic elements found, the researcher compared both of the elements to uncover the intrinsic elements transformation between *Ashputtel* and *Cinderella*. The tranformation can be spotted by used comparative literature approach to compared the similarities also disimilarities from each version. From the five intrinsic elements found, there were four intrinsic elements transformation found from Ashputtel to Cinderella. Namely, theme, plot, character and characterization, and setting.

In theme, *Ashputtel* and *Cinderella* have the same implicit theme. However, it is quite different with the explicit theme contained. The significant theme transformation stand out from the reason and purpose by each author. Grimms wrote *Ashputtel* to preserve European folktales as cultural identity, whereas Disney customizes *Cinderella* for the entertainment needs of American audience. *Ashputtel* has a longer plot than *Cinderella*, Disney adjust the plot by reduce the narration. The narration reduction in *Cinderella* is influenced by the film feature length in Disney. In Ashputtel by Grimms, the tale indicate the characters more realistic than magical that contained in *Cinderella* by Disney. The setting transformation has been found in *Ashputtel* and *Cinderella*. The setting of time in *Ashputtel* by Grimms shows more detail. Meanwhile in *Cinderella*, Disney did not write a setting of time when *Cinderella* lost her parents. The transformation occured because Grimms and Disney wanted to maintain their goals. Where Grimms wrote based on a tales that already exist among Germans, while Disney adapted the story for cinematic presentation for film production.

References

Calero, M. (2015). *Cinderella: What Makes Her So Popular?*. (Online), (https://www.rotoscopers.com/2015/02/21/cinderella-what-makes-her-so-popular/). accessed on 12 february 2022.

Bassnett, S. (1993). *Comparative Literature. A Critical Introduction* (p. 1). Oxford, UK: Blackwell Publishers.

Cresswell, J.W. (2009). *Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches. Third Edition*. California: SAGE Publications, Inc.

Lukens, R. J. (2007). *A Critical Handbook of Children's Literature*, (8): p. 24. Boston, United States: Pearson Education, Inc.

Lukens, R. J. (2007). *A Critical Handbook of Children's Literature*. Boston, United States: Pearson Education, Inc.

Riffaterre, M. (1978). *Semiotics Of Poetry*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Taylor, R. (1981). *Understanding The Elements Of Literature Its Forms, Techniques and Cultural Conventions* (p. 7-8). London: The Macmillan Press Ltd.

Wellek, R., & Warren, A. (1977). *Theory of Literature*. New York, London: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich Publisher.

Wurth, K.B ., & Rigney, A. (2006). *The Life Of Texts An Introduction To Literary Studies* (p. 19). Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.

Zipes, J. (2002). *The Brothers Grimm From Enchanted Forests To The Modern World,* (2). New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Zipes, J. (2002). *The Brothers Grimm From Enchanted Forests To The Modern World,* (2): p. 76. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.