

THE EFFECT OF STAD (STUDENT TEAM ACHIEVEMENT DIVISION) ON REFLECTIVE THINKING SKILL OF EFL LEARNERS

Ismaatul Yuniasti

STKIP PGRI Jombang, Indonesia

ismaatulyuniasti@gmail.com

Abstract

The purpose of this research is to answer the questions in the formulation of the problem. The research question is there any significant difference on the students' reflective thinking skills before they were taught by STAD method and after they were taught by STAD method? This research was intended to determine the effect of the Student Team Achievement Division (STAD) on reflective thinking skills. This research uses a pre-experimental using quantitative approach with one group, pre-test post-test design. Accidental sampling was a technique to gain. There are 15 students at Mts Unggulan Al-Kautsar as the researcher subjects. The report used to take the value of the data pre-questionnaire and post-questionnaire scores to find out if there is a difference before and after being given (STAD) in Reflective Thinking skills.

The results of the data analysis on the Wilcoxon signed rank test showed the value of Sig. (2-tailed) of $.003 < 0.05$, then (H_0) is rejected and (H_a) is accepted. It can be concluded that there is a significant difference in reflective thinking skills using STAD in the pre-questionnaire and post-questionnaire. Thus, it is necessary to enhance STAD to move up to the next level of reflection.

Keywords: STAD, Questionnaire, Reflective Thinking Skills

Introduction

Reflective thinking needs to be developed because it helps students think by encouraging students to connect new knowledge to solve a problem, think conceptually, and apply specific strategies to new tasks. In addition to a reflection on learning, good learning must also connect with the surrounding environment. Learning that is connected to the surrounding environment is easier for students to understand because students experience it directly. Reflective students are more likely to perform tasks such as remembering structured information, reading by understanding and interpreting texts, solving problems, and making decisions. Students who have a reflective style tend to spend more time responding and reflecting on the accuracy of answers Santrock (2010). Asshabi et al., (2022) divided reflective thinking skill to be six-aspects of skills.

The six-aspects of reflective thinking skills are cognitive skill is type of mental learning activity, such as conceptualizing learning experiences by thinking and asking about the learning process used by learning activities, as well as thinking about learning materials to improve learning. Evaluative skill is dealing with problems to evaluate the experience of learning English to understand and deepen the learning process. Metacognitive skill is the aspect of doing better the second time in the learning process in order to improve better / reflect learning beliefs and values for the second time. Interactional skill is interaction in the form of group discussion, collaboration, participation in a learning activity such as asking questions to check further understanding. Reflective journal skill is use of a notebook or book in which students write about experiences both in and out of school or record responses and reactions

to learning and learning activities. Retrospective skill is learners think about experiences and relate new information to previous ones to improve their learning, compare two things to find differences they make in their learning, refer to previous notes at different intervals to improve their learning. The six-aspects of reflective thinking skills have a relationship with learning in schools. The usual and common learning in schools is conventional learning, learning with a 5M scientific approach, namely observing, asking questions, gathering information, associating, and communicating. Apparently, this learning model has not been able to maximize the potential of students' reflective thinking skills. Students have a very important role in improving and developing human resources, if human resources are good, they will be able to maximize students' reflective thinking skills in learning. One of the lessons that can improve students' reflective thinking skills is cooperative learning. De Lisi and Gelbeck (1999) in (Supartayasa, 2014) state that the cooperative learning model is an important way to train students to think constructively, one of the cooperative learning models is Students' Team Achievement Division (STAD) learning model.

The Student Team Achievement Division known as STAD is one of the teaching methods in cooperative learning methods. STAD consist five main components that can have an impact on students' reflective thinking skills levels, the main components are the first divided into four or five students in every group. The teacher will make a class presentation, they will be given a learning topic that will be worked on as a team, in teamwork they are required to work with their team to ensure that all team members have mastered the

lesson. All students are required to help each other using several learning resources such as online, mobile learning applications, books, maps, and many other sources that are convenient for them to enhance group discussions and develop creativity Teemuangsai (2013), then they will be given individual quizzes about the material they have learned from their previous assignments and group members. This is an individual evaluation without teamwork. The individual progress score are calculated based on baseline scores test score, the researcher did not use this step because the researcher does not have the previous score from the teacher. The last is team recognition by giving awards for the efforts made by the group during the learning process. The team will get a certificate or other form of an award if the group's average score reaches certain criteria through the calculation of individual scores and group scores. Teams that meet certain criteria can earn rewards towards the end of the assignment. Based on the discussion above, this research wants to know the effect of using the Student Team Achievement Division (STAD) in students' reflective thinking skills. The goal to be achieved is to find differences in students' reflective thinking before and after using the Student Team Achievement Division (STAD) method.

RQ: Is there any significant difference on the students' reflective thinking skills before they were taught by STAD method and after they were taught by STAD method?

Theory

Student Team Achievement Division (STAD)

STAD is the easiest. As for class presentation, materials will be presented in class, including lecture-discussion, direct instruction on tasks, and audio-visual

presentations. Students need to focus on the presentations in order to help them understand the lesson completely. STAD is the easiest. Students work in groups and divided into four-member research teams that are mixed according to performance level, gender, and ethnicity. STAD allows students to help each other, and students in each group will do activities, such as discussion, comparing answers, and correcting mistakes of each other, helping them to do well for their team. After the class presentation and team preparation, students will sit for the individual quiz, and this time they have to work on their own. This method enables students to apply their own knowledge based on what they have learned. The marks are based on the student's improvement scores from previous quizzes. Points will be given to the group that has shown improvement from the earlier test. Team recognition then will be given to the team that manages to achieve the predetermined criteria. The team recognition may be in the form of badges, certificates, or any appropriate rewards.

Reflective thinking skills

Reflective thinking, according to Dewey (Rodgers, 2002; Yuni 2021), is an active, persistent, and meticulous examination of a belief or imagined form of knowledge, the grounds that support that knowledge, and the conclusions that knowledge leads to. During learning settings, learners are aware of and influence their learning by actively participating in reflective thinking - examining what they know, what they need to know, and how they bridge that gap. Dewey was the first scholar to introduce the term "reflection" into literature in his book "How We Think," published in 1933. He was fascinated by the act of introspection and how it took place. Dewey defined reflective thought as a mental process that begins with a feeling of uncertainty and then expands into a search for solutions to that uncertainty. Reflective thinking is characterized by a higher level of uncertainty and self-doubt. As a result, as human imagination opens the door to new possibilities, it is more likely to fly beyond existing knowledge and standards.

Reflective thinking is a skill that can assist learners in expressing tacit learning habits (Kizilkaya & Askar, 2009), which is the inability to actually explain what they know because they only know but do not understand

(Kuswandono, 2017). These abilities are also important in the development of critical thinking (Kizilkaya & Askar, 2009), and critical thinking is one of the criteria for high-order thinking. Then reflective thinking will assist students in developing higher-order thinking skills by encouraging them to connect new knowledge to prior understanding, to think abstractly and conceptually, to demonstrate specific strategies in novel tasks, and to understand their own thinking and learning strategies.

Method

Research Design

This research used Pre Experimental using Quantitative approach with one group (pre-test post-test design). Pre Experimental research involved administering pre-questionnaire to dependent variable, applying the experimental treatment to the subject, and administering the post-questionnaire. The result of the treatment is comparing in the preliminary questionnaire and post questionnaire score to find out if there is a difference before and after being given Student Team Achievement Divisions (STAD) with Reflective Thinking skills to students.

Research Setting

This research was carried out in class VIII Mts Unggulan Al Kautsar who was carrying out learning in English

Participant

The participants of the research eight grade at Mts Unggulan Al Kautsar that who have filled out the pre questionnaires and post questionnaire to the researcher as many as 15 students’.

Sampling Technique

This research uses Accidental Sampling which uses to determine the research sample size using the solving formula. According to (Sugiyono: 2016:124) Accidental, Sampling is a sampling technique based on chance, that is, any patient who coincidentally meets a researcher can be used as a sample if it is

deemed that the person who happened to be met is suitable as a data source. The sample is second-grade students at Mts Unggulan Al Kautsar (general public school) which in one class there is only one class, the number of students is 15, 11 girls, and 4 boys

Primary and Secondary Sources

The questionnaire report was used to obtaining questionnaire from Second grade of Mts Unggulan Al Kautsar using STAD on Reflective Thinking Skills of EFL Learners. A questionnaire was used to determine the effect STAD on Reflective Thinking Skills.

Statistical Analysis

The data after treatment was not met or not normally distributed because the value was < 0.05 . Based on this test, the statistical test that can be used is the Wilcoxon signed ranks test because it regulates data that are not normally distributed. In addition, the characteristics of this study were taken through a Likert scale instrument so that it was assumed that the data obtained were of the ordinal type, plus the number of respondents under 30, these reasons became the basis for the selection of the Wilcoxon signed ranks test statistical analysis

Data Collecting Procedure

The procedure of collecting the data and conducting the research in general are follows:

1. The researcher prepared the questionnaire as instruments that used in the research.
2. The researcher adapted and translated all of items of the instrument from English to Bahasa Indonesia.
3. The researcher tried out the instruments, to find out the results of the questionnaire are valid or invalid.

4. The instruments shared to the eight-class in MTs Unggulan Al-Kautsar by paper sheet.
5. After getting the data, the researcher analyzed the result of the data used SPSS 16.0 windows program.

Findings and Discussion

Findings

The normality of the data

The researcher does test for normality by using SPSS 16.0 program windows to know does the sample had normal distribution or not, the result is:

Tests of Normality

	Kolmogorov-Smirnov ^a			Shapiro-Wilk		
	Statistic	Df	Sig.	Statistic	Df	Sig.
BEFORE TREATMENT	.197	15	.123	.953	15	.567
AFTER TREATMENT	.205	15	.091	.851	15	.018

The basis for making normality test decisions using Kolmogorov Smirnov is as follows:

1. If the value of Sig. < Alpha research (0.05) then the data is not normally distributed
2. If the value of Sig. > Alpha research (0.05), then the data is normally distributed

Decision:

1. It is known that the value of Sig. (2-tailed) in the preliminary questionnaire of $0.567 > 0.05$, it can be concluded that the data is normally distributed
2. It is known that the value of Sig. (2-tailed) in the post questionnaire of $0.018 < 0.05$, it can be concluded that the data is not normally distributed.

Referring from the interpretation of the table above, it can be seen that the data after treatment was not met or not normally distributed because the value was <0.05 . Based on this test, the statistical test that can be used is the Wilcoxon signed ranks test because it regulates data that are not normally distributed. In addition, the characteristics of this study were taken through a Likert scale instrument so that it was assumed that the data obtained were of the ordinal type, plus the number of respondents under 30, these reasons became the basis for the selection of the Wilcoxon signed ranks test statistical analysis.

The result of before and after given treatment

To find out the answer to the research problem, the research showed the result of the Wilcoxon test from preliminary questionnaire before the treatment and post questionnaire after the treatment. In this part, the researcher calculated and analyzed the data from preliminary questionnaire and post questionnaire to know whether using student team achievement divisions (STAD) effect in reflective thinking skills at eighth-grade student MTs Unggulan Al Kautsar. The data collection of preliminary questionnaire and post questionnaire had a normal distributions, the researcher used Wilcoxon test to analyzed the data.

Wilcoxon signed ranks test

Wilcoxon signed ranks test used to know there a significant difference or not before and after using the treatment with Student Team Achievement Division (STAD) method. The result can be seen below:

Table 4.1 Wilcoxon Signed Ranks Test

	AFTER TREATMENT - BEFORE TREATMENT
Z	-2.983 ^a
Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed)	.003

Basis of decision result:

1. If the value of Sig. (2-tailed) < Alpha research (0.05), then Ho is rejected and Ha is accepted, then there is a significant difference between reflective thinking skills before and after giving STAD (Student Team Achievement Division) method.
2. If Si. (2-tailed) > Alpha research (0.05), then Ho is accepted and Ha is rejected, then there is no significant difference between reflective thinking skills before and after giving STAD (Student Team Achievement Division) method.

Decision:

Referring to table 4.1, the observed value of the data analysis on the Wilcoxon signed ranks test, it can be seen that Sig. (2 tailed) < Alpha. Value of Sig. (2-tailed) of .003 < 0.05, then (Ho) is rejected and (Ha) is accepted. It can be concluded that there is a significant difference between before and after treatment using STAD in the preliminary questionnaire and post

questionnaire. The explanation of the summary result of descriptive statistic can be seen below:

Table 4.2 Summary Results of Descriptive Statistics

	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	Minimum	Maximum
BEFORE TREATMENT	15	39.20	9.017	21	53
AFTER TREATMENT	15	54.87	9.471	34	64

Referring to table 4.2, the output above showed the total of respondent (N) and there is a significant increase mean score in students' reflective thinking skills between 2 variables, before and after treatment using STAD (Student Team Achievement Division), on the mean score from before treatment is 39.20 and after treatment is 54.87

Discussion

The researcher conducted the study by using a pre-experimental research design. It was conducted in one class, the class was given a preliminary questionnaire and post questionnaire. The treatment was the STAD method. STAD method is a method that is used by the researcher with grouping the students consists of five students.

The study was conducted to find out whether there was any significant effect on students' reflective thinking skills before and after they got the treatment. Regarding the research findings, the data were analyzed with the help of the SPSS 16.0 program windows version, the researcher concluded that the null hypothesis (H_0) was rejected and the alternative hypothesis (H_a) was accepted. Because the alternative hypothesis (H_a) was accepted it means that there is a significant effect of

using student team achievement divisions (STAD) on the reflective thinking skills of an eighth-grade student of MTS Unggulan Al Kautsar. There is a significant positive increase in mean scores in students' reflective thinking skills. STAD method is effective to be used in reflective thinking skills for eighth-grade students.

The STAD method is effective as a method for reflective thinking skills because the students can discuss with their friends to solve the given problems. It is supported by Slavin (2005), who stated the main idea of STAD is motivating the students to help and support each other in mastering the material taught by the teacher. It means that the students can not only learn from the teacher but also from their friends in the group. The STAD cooperative learning model focuses on activities and interactions between students to motivate and assist in mastering lessons to obtain maximum achievement Sutinah (2017). This statement is in line with Nikmah (2019) the STAD type cooperative learning model emphasizes collaboration in groups, this can provide opportunities for students to share experiences and opinions and motivate each other The learning process will be more interesting if there is a cooperation between students and students so that students with low skills can obtain knowledge and information from students who have higher expertise so that the learning process is more useful and students Do not feel bored to take part in learning in the classroom. Karacop's opinion (2017) that cooperative learning has a positive impact on student academic achievement and social skills development, so this model is suitable to be

applied because in this model students will be required to actively collaborate, and participants will be more motivated in learning and able to convey opinions Andrian (2020).

The cooperative model type STAD can actively find learning resources with peers, cooperative learning emphasizes team learning so this model is felt to be compatible with the character of student-centered thematic learning Primandari (2019) this opinion is in line with Susanti (2017). There is an interaction between students so that student learning activities can increase. Increasing student activity in groups can have an impact on student learning outcomes. In addition, an appreciation of students will have a positive impact on learning outcomes and can even train students to be responsible for what they do. The reward is a feature of the cooperative model type STAD Purwanto in Ernata (2017: 784) argues that reward is a tool to educate children so that children can feel happy because their work or deeds are rewarded, this is also supported by Nugroho in Rosyid (2018: 8) that reward is an award or reward that aims to make someone more active in improving themselves and increasing their performance so that they have an impact on learning outcomes.

In addition, the STAD method can have an impact on student learning, the previous study by Munawar (2019), the researcher concluded that the STAD (Student Team Achievement Division) model can improve motivation and learning outcomes, and Yunita et al., (2018) the research showed the implementation of cooperative learning type STAD learning model can improve mathematic learning outcomes. Dewi et al., (2020) The

research focus on the Improving Science Learning Outcomes Through STAD (Student Team Achievement Division), and got the result that there was a significant influence on the learning outcomes of science groups of students who were taught with the STAD type cooperative model with groups of students who were not taught with the STAD type cooperative model. Meanwhile, this study proves that does not only affect student learning outcomes, but also the reflective thinking skills that exist in students. Although the previous study and this research have differences in terms of the field they used the same technique that was STAD and it was effective.

Reflection in teaching is called the process of being able to restructure individuals' lives and commentate on them Stevens & Cooper (2009). Reflective thinking, according to Dewey in Rodge (2002) & Yuni (2021), is an active, persistent, and meticulous examination of a belief or imagined form of knowledge, the grounds that support that knowledge, and the conclusions that knowledge leads to. This process has an important role in individuals' taking responsibility for their decisions. Reflective thinking is the ability to think about the events and phenomena that occur in the learning environment during and after the education process and to make new arrangements within the framework of these thoughts McCollum (2002).

Reflective thinking is those who think reflectively and are constantly in search to make the learning process more qualified. In this context, reflective thinking is a process of deep thinking which requires

the individual to contemplate his or her behaviors and actions of any kind thus reorganizing the situations deemed deficient or imperfect. This situation lays a sense of responsibility on the individual for his or her actions. Reflective thinking allows students to think deliberately during the lesson so that students connect their preliminary learning with their newly acquired information Genç (2016). So, this opens the way to benefit from experiences in real life. In this sense, reflective thinking not only improves the conceptual world of a student's mother tongue but also enriches the world of thinking. Reflective thinking always keeps individual activities. The individual who gains experience in certain subjects contemplates these experiences and gets an opportunity to correct the situations he or she seems to be flawed. From this aspect, reflective thinking continuously takes place in a cyclic process. In this cyclic process, the individual gets the opportunity to solve the problems he or she faces. Within this context, reflective thinking contributes to the development of individuals' problem-solving skills. The reflective thinker finds the opportunity to try his or her experiences on different problems.

Nevertheless, based on Asshabi et al., (2022) the aspects of reflective thinking skills are interactional of reflective thinking skills, evaluative of reflective thinking skills, metacognitive of reflective thinking skills, retrospective reflective thinking skills, and reflective journal of reflective thinking skills. Reflective thinking skill is good for students because it provides students with an opportunity to step back and think about how they actually solve problems and how a particular set of

problem-solving strategies is appropriated for achieving their goal, it can be seen in the improvement in mean score before and after treatment with student team achievement division (STAD) that there is a significant difference. Thus, it can be concluded that the implementation of the STAD technique was effective on students' reflective thinking skill especially in the eighth grade of MTs Unggulan Al Kautsar.

Conclusion

Based on the explanation of findings in the previous chapter, the researcher concluded that there were obviously some main points related to the finding covered the students' reflective thinking skill by using Student Team Achievement Divisions (STAD) method. The researcher could conclude the result of this research as follows:

1. The results of the data analysis on the Wilcoxon signed ranks test, it can be seen that $\text{Sig. (2 tailed)} < \text{Alpha}$. Value of Sig. (2-tailed) of .003 < 0.05 , then (H_0) is rejected and (H_a) is accepted. It can be concluded that there is a significant difference on reflective thinking skills in the preliminary questionnaire and post questionnaire.
2. There is a significant increase mean score in students' reflective thinking skills between 2 variables, before and after treatment using Student Team Achievement Divisions (STAD) on the mean score from before treatment is 39.20 and after treatment is 54.87.

Based on the explanations, it can be concluded that STAD technique was effective used in reflective thinking skill at eight grade of MTs Unggulan Al Kautsar.

References

- Andrian, D., Wahyuni, A., Ramadhan, S., & Novilanti, F. R. E. (2020). *Pengaruh Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe STAD Terhadap Peningkatan Hasil Belajar, Sikap Sosial, dan Motivasi Belajar*. INOMATIKA, 2(1), 65-75
- Ary et.al.(2010). *Introduction to Research in Educational*. Canada: Nelson Education, Ltd.
- Asshabi et al., (2022) *Developing Reflective Language Learning Model: Structural Equation Modeling*. Department of Foreign Languages, Faculty of Literature, Humanities and Social Sciences; Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran
- A. Widowati (2016). *Developing science learning material with authentic inquiry learning approach to improve problem solving and scientific attitude*. Yogyakarta, Indonesia:Universitas Negeri
- Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Educational Research: Planning, Conducting, and Evaluating Quantitative and Qualitative Research* (4th Ed). Boston: Pearson Education, Inc
- Dewi, et al., (2020) *Improving Science Learning Outcomes through Student Team Achievement Division (STAD)*. Universitas Pendidikan Ganesa
- Ernata, Y. (2017). *Analisis motivasi belajar siswa melalui pemberian reward dan punishment di sdn ngaringan 05 kec. gendusari kab. blitar*. Jurnal Pemikiran dan Pengembangan Sekolah Dasar (JP2SD), 5(2), 781-790
- Genç, M. A. (2016). Evaluation of gifted and talented students' reflective thinking in visual arts course. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 4(9), 2039- 2048.
- Ghozali, Imam. (2013). *Aplikasi Analisis Multivariate dengan Program IBM SPSS 21 Update PLS Regresi*. Semarang, Indonesia: Badan Penerbit Universitas Diponegoro.
- Hamdani. (2011). *Strategi belajar mengajar*. Bandung, Indonesia: CV Pustaka Setia
- Ibrahim. (2017). *Perpaduan Model Pembelajaran Aktif Konvensional (Ceramah) Dengan Kooperatif (Make-A Match) untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan*. Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan Sosial, Sains, dan Humaniora, 3(2), 199-211.
- Jeffries, L., Mikulecky, B. S., & Mikulecky, B. S. (2012). *Basic reading power 1 : extensive reading, vocabulary building, comprehension skills, thinking skills*. USA: Pearson Longman.

- Karacop, A. (2017). *"The Effect of Using Jigsaw Method Based on Cooperative Learning Model in the Undergraduate Science Laboratory Practices"*. Universal Journal of Educational Research, Vol. 5, No. 3 (hlm. 420-434)
- Munawar (2019) *The application of STAD-Cooperative Learning Model: Efforts to increase motivation and Learning Outcomes of students in Class 5 SD N 07 Ledok Salatiga in Mathematics subjecth in Folding Symmetry and Rotating Symmetry topics*
- McCollum, S. (2002). *Reflection: A key for effective teaching*. Teaching Elementary Physical Education. 6- 7.
- Nikmah, E. H., Fatchan, A., & Wirahayu, Y. A. (2016). *Model Pembelajaran Student Teams Achievement Divisions (STAD), Keaktifan dan Hasil Belajar Siswa*. Jurnal Pendidikan Geografi, 3(3), 1-17
- NUR'AENI. (2013). *Developmen students reading ability by using student team achievement division (STAD) teachnique: a classroom action reseach in the yer of VII-6 clas of SMPN 17 Tangerang Selatan*. UIN Syarif Hidayatulloh.
- Primandari, P. A., Sulasmono, B. S., & Setyaningtyas, E. W. (2019). *"Perbedaan Pengaruh Model Kooperatif Tipe TGT Dan STAD dengan Multimedia Interaktif Ceria Terhadap Sikap Sosial Dan Hasil Belajar Kognitif Pada Pembelajaran Tematik Kelas 5 SD"*. Jurnal Basicedu, 3(1), 83-91.
- Rodgers, C. (2002). *Defining reflection: Another look at John Dewey and reflective thinking*. Teachers College Record, 104(4), 842–866.
- Rosyid, M. Z. (2018). *Reward & Punishment Dalam Pendidikan*. Malang: Literasi Nusantara
- Santrock, J. W. (2010). *Psikologi pendidikan* (3rd ed.). Kencana Prenada Media Group
- Susanti, Y., Wahjoedi, W., & Utaya, S. (2017). *Aktivitas Belajar Tematik Siswa Kelas V Sd Melalui Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe STAD*. Jurnal Pendidikan Humaniora/Sains.
- Sutinah, S., & Degeng, N. S. (2017). *Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe Students Team Achievment Devision (STAD)*. In Prosiding Seminar Nasional Mahasiswa Kerjasama Direktorat Jenderal Guru dan Tenaga Kependidikan Kemendikbud 2016.
- Sugiyono. (2016). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatifdan R&D*. Bandung: PT Alfabet.
- Slavin, Robert.E. (2015). *Cooperative Learning*. Bandung: Penerbit Nusa Media.

- Stevens, D. D. & Cooper, J. E. (2009). *Journal keeping: How to use reflective writing for effective learning, teaching, professional insight, and positive change*. Virginia: Stylus Publishing, LLC.
- Tiantong, M., & Teemuangsai, S. (2013). *Student team achievement divisions (STAD) technique through the moodle to enhance learning achievement*. International Education Studies, 6(4), 85–92
- Taniredja, Tukiran, et.al. (2011). *Model-Model Pembelajaran Inovasi*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Wardiah, D. (2015). *Keefektifan Model Pembelajaran Stad (Student Team Achievement Division) Dalam Memahami Wacana Siswa Kelas Viii Smp Tridarma Palembang*. Wahana Didaktika, 12(3), 30–42
- Yunita et al., (2018) *increasing learning outcomes using cooperative learning type student team achievement division (STAD) methodology with fifth grade second semester students at SD Negeri Sumogawe 1 Kec. Getasan, Kab.Semarang 2017/2018*